

111th Guild Council Wednesday, 24th, April 2024 GCR @ 6pm

1. WELCOME AND OPENING

6:05pm Acknowledgement of Country

1.1 Attendance

Indi Creed (IC)

Jelena Kovacevic (JK)

Nikhita Talluri (NT)

James Hodgman (JH)

CJ Daudu (CJD)

Aiden Kirby-Smith (AKS)

Lauren Kohlen (LK)

Keertikka Ganesan (KG)

Mehardeep Kaur (MH)

Shreya Bhardwaj (SB)

Alexia Wood (AW)

Lorenzo lannuzzi (LI)

Rishav Neog (RN)

Archit Menon (AME)

Akshata Jois (AJ)

Paige Brandwood (PB)

Chloe Lazaroo (CL)

Amira Nunn (AN)

Anya Kai (AK)

Alevine Magila (AM)

Olivia Stronach (OS)

Lucinda Bartlett (LB)

Parham Bahrami (PBR)

Rama Sugiartha (RS)

Luke Alderslade (LA)

Juan Lakonawa (JL)

Hayley Rahn (HR)

Claudia Mulvoy (CM)

Joshua Ho (JHO)

Finn Penter (FP)

Selina al Ansari (SA)

Tony Goodman (TG)

Mutya Joseph (MJ)

1.2 Apologies

Rachel Yeo

Korede Oyemade

Sammie Smith

1.3 Proxies

Jay Williams for Sammie Smith Ritika Menon for Rachel Yeo

1.4 Absent



Motion to accept all proxies. Moved: JK Seconded: MV

This motion passes.

2. DECLARATION OF POTENTIAL OR PERCEIVED CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

N/A

3. CONFIRMATION OF PREVIOUS MINUTES

Moved: JK Seconded: JH

This motion passes.

4. BUSINESS ARISING FROM PREVIOUS MINUTES

N/A

5. BUSINESS COMPLETED VIA CIRCULAR

N/A

AM moves a procedural motion to move to item 13.

AM wishes to discuss items that could produce debate at the beginning of the meeting while the Council is fresh.

Motion does not pass.

6. DIRECTORS' REPORTS

6.1 Managing Director

TG notes we have moved forward with acquittal documents for 2023, been signed off by the University. Still working on Department reviews. TG notes that the Masterplan is moving quickly, going to tender soon, with four builders coming through. TG notes that WAEC has confirmed that they will run the election this year, Mary will be the RO again. TG explains 2023 Annual Report is nearly done. TG notes that Directors will be going on a strategy day.

6.2 Finance Director

MJ notes that for the month of March, we landed at \$34,838 income as opposed to budgeted \$49,473. MJ notes that the budget is still ahead YTD, income of \$104,979 as opposed to a loss of \$114k. MJ notes there are still

UWA STUDENT GUILD
The University of Western Australia
M300, 35 Stirling Highway | Crawley, WA 6009
(08) 6488 2295 | hello@guild.uwa.edu.au
facebook.com/UWAStudentGuild | @UWAStudentGuild

111th Guild Council Wednesday, 24th, April 2024 GCR @ 6pm

some outstanding expenses that may affect this, and with other budgeted expenses, income will move closer to budget. MJ notes that merchandise sales are lower than expected in the GSC. MJ notes the tavern has made a loss of \$5k as opposed to a projected income of \$33k.

IC raises a point of clarification as she thinks we should be moving in camera for the outlets. MJ clarifies she will get into that later.

MJ notes student budgets are all good except Guild Council and SOC, but that is just a timing issue. MJ notes Student Assist is above budget but below YTD, events is below budget but waiting on expenses from O-Day. Marketing and finance also over budget due to income for the prior and sick leave for the latter.

Motion to move in camera, passes. Motion to move out of camera, passes.

- 6.3 Commercial As tabled.
- 6.4 Student Services As tabled.
- 6.5 Venture Student Innovation Centre As tabled.

7. QUESTIONS TIME - Directors' Reports

LA asks about the Guild Corporate Social Responsibility Framework. TG explains it has been put together and Governance are working through it.

AM asks about the getaway management are taking. TG clarifies they will be running through strategy documents.

8 STUDENT REPORTS

8.1 Guild President (AR)

IC explains she had back-to-back meetings and that is why her report was late. She explains that the Guild have tentatively secured \$10k for the Food Pantry and that UWA will be running \$100k worth of cost-of-living grants for students.

- 8.2 Guild Vice-President (AT)
- 8.3 Guild General Secretary (AT)

NT notes she fixed an issue with the attendance record.

- 8.4 Chair of Guild Council (AT)
- 8.5 Education Council President (AT)
- 8.6 Societies Council President (AT)
- 8.7 Public Affairs Council President (AT)
- JW clarifies SS updated some meeting times.
- 8.8 Women's Officer (AT)
- 8.9 Wellbeing Officer (AT)
- 8.10 Postgraduates Students' Association President (AT)

UWA STUDENT THE UN M300, (08) 64 facebook

UWA STUDENT GUILD
The University of Western Australia
M300, 35 Stirling Highway | Crawley, WA 6009
(08) 6488 2295 | hello@guild.uwa.edu.au
facebook.com/UWAStudentGuild | @UWAStudentGuild

111th Guild Council Wednesday, 24th, April 2024 GCR @ 6pm

- 8.11 International Students' Department President (AT)
- 8.12 Residential Students' Department President (AT)
- 8.13 Environment Officer (AT)
- 8.14 Sports Officer (NS)
- 8.15 Access Department (AT)

OS gives a reminder about disability awareness training and autism awareness month and recent NDIS changes.

8.16 Pride Officers (AT)

8.17 Ethnocultural Officers (AT)

8.18 Volunteering Chair (AT)

8.19 OGCs

AKS (AT)

AM (AT)

AN (AT)

AME (AT)

CL (AT)

MK (AT)

RY (AT)

SB (AT)

9. QUESTIONS TIME - Student Reports

OS asks LK about Albany online events. LK says that she will pass details of the Albany Director along.

OS asks RS and PBR what they think OB town halls have been like. PBR says it is good to get out of the Council rom and put yourself out there.

LA asks NT about the initial results of the parking survey. NT explains students are dissatisfied with the current situation and that many students have given written feedback to that effect. NT explains they are collating results.

LA asks NT if the sentiment has gotten better or worse with EasyPark. NT explains that with the new system come new frustrations, but IC is working on it case by case. She explains the parking survey is focused on looking at outcomes that can be achieved for students. IC also explains that students are not just displeased with EasyPark – it is mostly frustration with availability of parking.

LA asks AJ what the numbers were on the Universal Submission times polling. IC finds the numbers and it was 1636 votes for 11:59pm, 113 votes no. 1504 students said that 11:59pm would make their UWA experience better. Over 300 written responses.

OS ask if there is a backup if EasyPark is ever down. PB says there is. IC says she will follow up on the use of permits without the app.

CL asks if 11:59pm is for all assessments, as some design assessments have to be handed in during the day. IC clarifies it is only for online submissions and there are exceptions.



OS asks if this will crash LMS with multiple submissions at the same time. IC clarifies this has been checked and it is not a problem.

JK moves a motion to accept reports, seconded by IC. It passes.

Motion to move to welfare break, moved by JK and seconded by IC. This motion passes.

10. BUSINESS FROM THE EXECUTIVE

10.1

The 111th Guild Council approves the 2023 Audited Financial Accounts and the 2023 SSAF Acquittal documents.

Moved: India Creed Seconded: Nikhita Talluri

IC says MJ and team have been working hard on this one. MJ explains that the Guild made an income of \$428,386 in 2023 as opposed to a budgeted loss of \$567k, mainly due to SSAF and a higher return on the Investment pool. She says this is a really good result for the Guild. MJ explains we have a positive cash flow from operations. MJ explains that the investment pool has increased \$700k year to year from 2020.

This motion passes.

10.2

The 111th Guild Council appoints Lucinda Bartlett as Access Co-Officer, on recommendation of the Governance Committee.

Moved: Jelena Kovacevic Seconded: India Creed

JK says Lucinda was the recommendation from the ongoing Access officer and she is the current Acting officer. OS says Lucinda has been doing a good job.

This motion passes.

10.3

The 111th Guild Council appoints Alexia Wood as Pride Co-Officer, on recommendation of the Governance Committee.

Moved: Jelena Kovacevic Seconded: India Creed



JK explains Governance has voted based on the recommendations from the Pride Committee. LI speaks for, explaining Alexia has done a lot of good work so far.

This motion passes.

10.4

The 111th Guild Council:

- 10.4.1 Notes that currently, Department and Sub-Council Committee membership is not audited or noted by management, which presents a security risk to the Guild.
- 10.4.2 Directs all Office-bearers with Committees to send a complete list of all Committee positions and who they are filled by, also those persons' student number, application date and appointment date where appropriate and who they are filled by to the Managing Director and General Secretary no later than the 1st of May, 2024.
- 10.4.3 Directs the Governance Committee to incorporate this security measure into the relevant Guild regulations or standing orders.

Moved: Indi Creed

Seconded: Nikhita Talluri

IC explains that this is a security risk to management and to the Board, we need to know who is acting under our authority. IC notes this should be incorporated as a measure across the board.

IC makes a friendly amendment to include complete list of Committee positions and who they are filled by also those persons' application date and appointment date, where appropriate.

RS moves an amendment to include student numbers on the list. This is friendly.

This motion passes.

10.5

The 111th Guild Council:

10.5.1 Accepts the resignation of Sanya Singhal as OGC,

10.5.2 Directs the Managing Director to contact WAEC for a recount.

Moved: Indi Creed

Seconded: Nikhita Talluri

IC states Sanya has sent her letter of resignation today, it will go to WAEC for a recount. AM asks what the timeline is for a recount. TG explains it is electronic so should not take long.

This motion passes.

11. ELECTIONS

UWA STUDENT

GULD

The Univ.

M300, 35
(08) 6483
facebook

UWA STUDENT GUILD
The University of Western Australia
M300, 35 Stirling Highway | Crawley, WA 6009
(08) 6488 2295 | hello@guild.uwa.edu.au
facebook.com/UWAStudentGuild | @UWAStudentGuild

111th Guild Council Wednesday, 24th, April 2024 GCR @ 6pm

11.1 Election Culture

Two (2) Members of Guild Council

Proposer: JK Seconder: IC

Nominations: Keertikka Ganesan and Olivia Stronach

Elected unopposed.

11.2 Publications

One (1) Member of Guild Council

Proposer: IC Seconder: LI

Nomination: CJ Daudu

Elected unopposed.

11.3 Referendum Standing Committee One (1) member of Guild Council

Proposer: IC Seconder: LI

Nomination: Mehardeep Kaur

Elected unopposed.

11.4 Enterprise Bargaining Agreement Committee One (1) member of Guild Council

Proposer: IC Seconder: LI

Nomination: Lucinda Bartlett

Elected unopposed.

12. MOTIONS ON NOTICE (OPERATIONS)

13.0 MOTIONS WITHOUT NOTICE (OPERATIONS)

13.1

The 111th Guild Council approves the date of Tuesday 8th October 2024 at 1:00pm for the 2024 Ordinary General Meeting.

Moved: Indi Creed

Seconded: Nikhita Talluri





IC explains late as only received dates after the deadline.

Motion to hear without notice passes.

IC explains that a date has been found during common lunch hour.

This motion passes.

13.2

The 111th Guild Council:

- 13.2.1 Accepts and endorses proposed changes to the UWA Student Guild Election regulations prepared by Jackson McDonald on advice of the Governance Committee, noting that changes regarding Independents have already been endorsed by Council,
- 11.2.2 Directs the Managing Director to commence engagement with the University to ratify these changes as a matter of urgency.

Moved: India Creed

Seconded: Jelena Kovacevic

IC explains this was late as we were waiting on advice from the lawyers and for recommendation from Governance.

Motion to hear without notice passes.

IC explains that lawyers have prepared a package for Senate and notes the changes regarding independents have already passed GC in principle. She further explains that changes to social media and referendums have come on advice of Senate.

AM states this motion is scandalous. AM states it is now not binding to hold a referendum.

IC explains that the difference between referendums and plebiscites is based on either changing the legal principles of an organisation or the ideological stances of an organisation – they are used for different purposes.

AM states it is still not binding.

IC and TG explain the result would come to Guild Council essentially for approval and therefore be essentially binding. TG explains this is a change in stance enforced by the student body not a change in governing documents.

AM argues against the motion as a referendum is stronger.

CJD speaks for the motion, asking if from his understanding of the situation, referendums were never really binding in the past as we were using them wrong. CJD explains this is not a pivot on democracy.

AM and TG debate the motion and the binding and non-binding intricacies of referendums and whether changes to policy are referendums.



111th Guild Council Wednesday, 24th, April 2024 GCR @ 6pm

IC explains that without the proper terms here our polling is not binding according to the lawyers.

LI explains that there are also other ways to force the Guild to adopt a stance, this is not the only way.

AM moves a procedural motion to put the motion to vote.

IC says she was about to speak. AM withdraws the procedural motion. IC asks if they can go back to the lawyers for more advice.

AS says the definitions of referendum and plebiscite should be used as is. LA speaks in favour of the motion as-is, saying the lawyers have recommended and it is a simple wording change.

OS asks for a point of clarification as to whether Guild Council could just choose to not run a referendum. IC says yes, this is why there is a binding process to just call an SGM.

AM says the change is unnecessary.

The motion is put. This motion passes.

14.0 MOTIONS ON NOTICE (REPRESENTATION)

14.1

The 111th Guild Council:

- 14.1.1 Applauds the Cook-Labor Government for their introduction of the Births. Deaths and Marriages Registration Amendment (Sex or Gender Changes) Bill 2024, which abolishes the Gender Reassignment Board and allows WA residents to change their sex descriptor to the non-binary descriptor.
- 14.1.2 Applauds and acknowledges the work by TransFolk WA, Queer Liberation Boorloo, and other Queer advocate groups in lobbying. protesting, and advocating for the amendment of these laws.
- 14.1.3 Recognizes that this is a monumental step in achieving equal rights and protections for queer students.
- 14.1.4 Acknowledges that more can be done; that the Equal Opportunity Act still requires amendment, and Conversion Therapy is still legal.
- 14.1.5 Supports the Pride Department's efforts in advocating for the Equal Opportunity Act to be amended and that Conversion Therapy be criminalized.

Moved by: Lorenzo lannuzzi Seconded by: Alexia Wood

LI moves a friendly amendment to add mention of advocates to the motion.

LI explains that the laws are finally changing but this is not far enough.

AW agrees and hopes the new legislation will save lives.



111th Guild Council Wednesday, 24th, April 2024 GCR @ 6pm

AM speaks for the motion, stating it is an important progressive move. AM clarifies that he wants to be critical of Labour as this was promised 6 years ago. He thinks it is generous to applaud the Cook Government. AM states the reform could've gone further.

IC speaks for the motion. IC explains it has been a long time coming as people have been waiting 6 years, she is happy to see this change happening, but it is not the full picture for gender diverse people in WA. IC states we are still behind.

This motion passes.

14.2

The 111th Guild Council:

- 14.2.1 Notes that the University Accord called for financial support for students undergoing mandatory unpaid placements as part of their degrees,
- 14.2.2 Notes that students undergoing mandatory unpaid placements are at higher risk of experiencing student poverty, due to large working hours that limit the ability to conduct paid work,
- 14.2.3 Acknowledges that student placements contribute essential work to public and private organisations in addition to educating students, and should therefore be paid,
- 14.2.4 Calls upon the Labor Government outlaw unpaid placements amendment.
- 14.2.5 Calls upon the Labour Government to include support for paid placements in the 2024 Federal Budget and for UWA to support this measure -amendment.
- 14.2.6 Calls upon the WA State Government to provide support for unpaid placements should the federal Government not include in the budget amendment.
- 14.2.7 Instructs the President and the PSA President to work with relevant stakeholders to produce a statement to be released on social media in support of paid placements,

Moved by: CJ Daudu Seconded by: India Creed

CJD states that this is a student issue that we have been working on for a long time and was mentioned in the Accord. He states his predecessor was working on this and thinks it is important for GC to recognise that students are struggling.

IC states that students doing mandatory placements are doing real work and it is equivalent to those who are doing the same work and being paid a large amount of money. She thinks it is inequitable and thinks the Labor government must acknowledge this especially if they are truly for workers.

LA asks what UWA's stance on this is. IC explains there is an expectation that the government must move before universities do. She explains that if there is

UWA STUDENT GUILD UWA STUDENT The University of Western Australia M300, 35 Stirling Highway | Crawley, WA 6009 (08) 6488 2295 | hello@guild.uwa.edu.au facebook.com/UWAStudentGuild | @UWAStudentGuild

111th Guild Council Wednesday, 24th, April 2024 GCR @ 6pm

no movement in the budget, she won't leave it there, as there have been case studies of universities actioning this independent of government.

LA moves an amendment calling on the university to take action. This is friendly. IC words it as: If the Labor government does not include support in the 2024 federal budget, calls upon the WA state government to apply a stipend for students undergoing mandatory paid placements.

AM moves an amendment to outlaw unpaid placements rather than calling for support in the federal budget. This is friendly and overrules the previous motion. AM moves his speaking rights to an observer. Motion passes. FP says that it is outrageous that unpaid placements exist. He explains it is exploitation and it is important to outlaw it. He also states it is important to critique Labor on this point. He also says it is important we call out the University.

OS speaks for the motion. She explains engineering placements are all paid, and it is unjust for other students and deters them from doing certain degrees.

IC speaks for the motion. She says it is almost a misnomer to call these unpaid placements – as you are paying for the unit, so you are paying to do free labour for another organisation. She says we laugh but it is insane.

The motion passes.

15.0 MOTION WITHOUT NOTICE (REPRESENTATION)

15.1

The 111th Guild Council:

- 15.2.1 Stands in solidarity with the victims, their loved ones, emergency service responders, and heroes in the Bondi attack on the 13th of April 2024, all of whom have been significantly impacted by gender-based violence.
- 15.1.1 Acknowledges the devastating impact of this horrific attack on the student body at UWA and acknowledges the prevalence of mental health issues and persistent cultural stigma within our communities.
- 15.1.2 Commits to raising ongoing awareness campaigns and creating educational materials focused on addressing gender-based violence and fostering a culture of safety and respect within our community.
- 15.1.3 Demands that Federal and State governments acknowledge this as a National Emergency and immediately reviews existing policies, protocols, and legislation related to the safety and wellbeing of students, with a particular focus on ensuring the protection of women and marginalised individuals within the community.
- 15.1.4 Urges ongoing review between the university and community organisations to develop and implement effective strategies and initiatives aimed at preventing and addressing gender-based violence.
- 15.1.5 Condemns the spike of Islamophobia, antisemitism and any forms of hatred following the attack and stands against expressions of racism from the public and media during events of violence in the Australian community.
- 15.1.6 Notes that individuals with mental health issues are not typically violent despite discourse in the media implying otherwise.
- 15.1.7 Encourages Guild Councillors and students to:



7.1. Reach out for support to Student Assist, counselling services at UWA, or external wellbeing services,

7.2. Attend and promote the 'No More: National Rally Against Violence' (a movement highlighting the devastating rates and impacts of gender-based violence in Australia) organised by 'What Were You Wearing'.

Moved by: Paige Brandwood Seconded by: Lauren Kohlen

PB explains that the motion was late because the event happened recently. Motion to hear without notice passes.

PB explains that we are currently in a crisis when it comes to gender-based violence. Another woman died today bringing it to 31 women this year from GBV. PB explains that it is devastating. PB explains she wants to urge the state and federal government to look at making a change. PB thanks PBR and LK for work on the motion. PB encourages councillors to attend the What Are You Wearing? Rally on Sunday.

LK reiterates that it is devastating and reiterates the importance of ensuring that there is support for students on campus.

LA moves an amendment to 15.1.2 to include acknowledgement that there is a prevalence of mental health issues and persistent cultural stigma around in our community. This is friendly.

OS moves an amendment to acknowledge that not all people with mental health issues are violent. This is friendly.

JK asks whether this is an addition or an amendment. OS clarifies this is an addition.

AW speaks for the motion. AW says that PB and LK are brave to bring this forward. This is a difficult topic that is hard to address.

PBR speaks for the motion. He explains that the immediate response after the attack was horrific, and it is the exact discourse that makes students feel unsafe on campus and unsafe to be themselves.

AM speaks for the motion and says that the online discourse was messed up. He explains that the discourse was Islamophobic and antisemitic. He says it shows the strength of the far-right. He flags that Jacinta Price called for more police to combat gender-based violence and this has been a factor in First Nations oppression. He worries this will be used as pretext to increase police presence and funding, worsening oppression. He explains that he thinks GBV is an intense manifestation of sexism in society. He states we need more funding to support services.

IC speaks for the motion and states this is a sensitive issue that is not going away. We must create a culture of safety and respect in our community and cannot solve this with just policing. She states that as student leaders, we can all take part in this mission to fight against sexism on campus.



PB states she agrees with AM that policing is not the fix and could make things worse.

This motion passes.

Motion for a welfare break. Moved: JK Seconded: IC This motion passes.

15.2

The 111th Guild Council:

- 15.2.2 Notes the impact that influenza and other viruses can have on the health and quality of life of immunocompromised students and staff at the University.
- 15.2.3 Recognises the responsibility of individuals to contribute to herd immunity to assist with protecting members of the University and broader community who cannot be vaccinated.
- 15.2.4 Encourages all staff and students, who can be vaccinated, to make use of the vaccinations currently offered in Guild Village by the UWA Medical Centre.
- 15.2.5 Commits to promotion of the free vaccinations available and ongoing education around the importance of vaccination, in consultation with the Access & Wellbeing Department and relevant stakeholders.

Moved by: Lucinda Bartlett

Seconded by: Olivia Stronach

LB explains motion was late as department was busy with Access Week.

Motion to hear without notice passes.

LB explains that as we approach flu season, we need to promote herd immunity. She notes that it is community responsibility to come together to protect the quality of life of others.

OS explains she wanted to raise this for immunocompromised individuals for whom herd immunity is important – it is an invisible accessibility issue and catching the flu can be deadly.

AM moves to waive speaking rights. This motion passes.

HR speaks in favour of the motion. Thinks that getting vaccinated is an act of solidarity with elderly people and immunocompromised students and staff. HR notes that this should be a requirement from the government. HR explains confusion as to why COVID isn't mentioned in the motion.





OS responds that there is already a Guild stance on COVID, so it is not worth redebating.

LB speaks for the motion, noting we aren't debating mandating, we are just talking about vaccination and there are people who can't get vaccinated for various reasons, including religious freedoms.

AM responds to state that everyone should get vaccinated, and this is a basic act of solidarity. He states that some people don't get vaccinated because they are Liberal Party voting Christians, and they should get vaccinated because the needs of the collective outweigh the interests of far-right conspiracy theorists. He supports enforcing mandatory universal vaccination policies.

OS states she does not think it is our job as students to be dictating religious freedoms.

AM states the Guild can put up political positions.

OS states she does not think it is our place to infringe on religious freedoms.

LB states there is solid evidence that herd immunity is positive, and we can draw the line there.

LA speaks for the motion and says we should protect the community, and this is a sensible motion.

AM asks if vaccinations are free on campus.

OS clarifies she is mostly sure. AJ confirms it is free for students. AW confirms some private practitioners do charge a fee.

This motion passes.

16.0 GENERAL BUSINESS

16.1 **Cost of Living Grants**

IC explains that the Council has the opportunity to give feedback on Student Life's cost of living grant proposal. The Council discusses the criteria for the Guild's emergency grants, the eligibility of international students, membership of a student on the panel deciding who gets grants, the amount of money required per grant, follow up support for students, community initiative referral, limitations on how money can be spent, intervention if students are suffering beyond the terms of the grant, resourcing for the administration of the project, redirection of unapproved grants to other support services. IC will pass on feedback to the University.

16.2 **Easy English in Reports**



OS explains that it would be good if people could try to use simple language and dot points in their reports to consider accessibility, particularly as reports are published online for all students.

16.3 Report on Racism

RS explains that we are in design stage for the racism report survey, he has been meeting with the departments and would appreciate any further feedback. He explains there will be a consultation session in the Fishbowl on Thursday, from 10-12. It will be an open consultation. The full survey will be brought to EDC and then to GC for final approvals to make sure it is ethically viable.

16.4 Pride Quiz Night

LI explains Pride is having a Quiz Night on May 9th and invites the Council and friends to attend.

16.5 Survey on Disability Discrimination

OS explains Access is doing a survey on accessibility and invites interested members to reach out if they want to give feedback.

17. CLOSE at 8.00PM AND NEXT MEETING

The next meeting is scheduled for **Wednesday**, **29**th **May 2024 at 6.00pm**. Please contact the Guild General Secretary (secretary@guild.uwa.edu.au) with apologies or proxies. If unable to attend, please advise which dates you are available to reschedule if a quorum cannot be met.